

## Appendix 6 – Information shared by CREATE Fertility

On 24 November 2017, the CCG received a direct tweet from Praful Nargund at CREATE fertility, which aims to ‘deliver high quality, safe IVF treatment at an affordable cost’.

The tweet was in response to a post from the CCG Twitter account asking people to read the FAQs around our proposals to restrict access to IVF and vasectomies/sterilisations in B&NES. Praful claimed to have offered BaNES CCG ‘lower cost IVF, delivering huge savings without the need to restrict’. Please see below.

In addition to the tweet, Praful completed the CCG’s questionnaire about the proposals and included more detail about his organisation. Therefore, on 7 December 2017, the CCG emailed Praful to ask for more information about where his organisation currently provides NHS fertility services, what the services are and how much they cost.

This exchange led to a call on 28 December between Praful and Catherine Phillips, BaNES CCG’s Senior Commissioning Manager for Acute Care. During this call, Catherine learned that ‘CREATE have been involved in conversations for some time with ministers and NHS England about providing IVF at accessible costs to individuals and CCGs... Praful believes he has seen a range of £2,000 to £10,000 for comparable IVF work nationally.’

Catherine also learned that CREATE currently provide private fertility services locally (Clifton, Bristol) and that a new premises is due to open in Bristol in the new financial year – complete with laboratory and theatre. It is anticipated that this new branch of CREATE will provide NHS-commissioned services in Bristol as part of an Any Qualified Provider contract.

Overall, Praful estimated that approximately 10 per cent of the services his organisation provides are NHS-commissioned. He believes that there is significant overcharging in the NHS and that CCGs do not understand the current costs of fertility services and that they have decreased over recent years.

In early January 2018, Praful provided the CCG with information on costings of IVF and fertility services with CREATE, as well as outcomes data. The outcomes data indicate that clinical pregnancy rates at one of the CREATE clinics between July 2015 and June 2016 were comparable, and in some cases better, across all age groups compared with Bath Fertility Clinic – the current NHS provider (and a private provider) in B&NES. For example, clinical pregnancy rates among women aged 35-37 years were 42 per cent at CREATE’s clinic compared with 23 per cent at Bath Fertility Clinic. Please see below for the full data on clinical outcomes – from the Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority.

In terms of cost, a recent benchmarking document to NHS England from CREATE indicates figures of £2,199 for a full IVF cycle including all drugs, while the estimated price per cycle with Bath Fertility Clinic is £3530. Note that these figures are an average and could differ according to the actual treatment given.

These average figures represent a possible saving of approximately £1,331 per cycle with CREATE services, and across the average 60 couples undergoing IVF in B&NES annually, amounts to almost £80,000 saved per year. This is very close to the £100-160,000 savings that are estimated by the CCG's current proposals to restrict access to IVF services according to age, BMI, partner's age and duration of infertility.

It must also be noted that there would be a cost and resource implication for the CCG if the fertility service was re-procured. There would also be at least a one-year delay before a new provider took on the service and the CCG saw any savings made as a result of terminating the current service provider's contract.

1. Tweet from Praful Nargund:



2. Clinical outcomes data:

Note on Clinical Outcomes

As part of the discussion between Catherine Philips and Praful Nargund in relation to assisted conception services, it was agreed that PN would supply financial information previously submitted to NHS England and outcome information. Financial information has already been provided, and this note highlights information on clinical outcomes.

We share this information in order to demonstrate that there are both clinically and cost effective alternatives to the rationing of IVF accessibility. CREATE, like many other providers, would be able to deliver excellent outcomes whilst significantly reducing the costs incurred by Bath and North East Somerset CCG. In 2018, CREATE will open a full-service IVF centre in Bristol (currently being fitted-out), meaning that all care would be delivered in the local setting.

HFEA Published, Clinical Pregnancy Rates per cycle July 2015-June 2016

	<35	35-37	38-39	40-42
National Average	38%	33%	25%	19%
CREATE St Paul's	47%	42%	30%	20%
Bath Fertility Clinic	42%	23%	20%	12%

HFEA Published, Frozen Embryo Transfer Clinical Pregnancy Rates per cycle July 2015-June 2016

	<35	35-37	38-39	40-42
National Average	37%	33%	28%	24%
CREATE St Paul's	43%	41%	22%	20%
Bath Fertility Clinic	35%	19%	35%	N/A

3. Costing information from NHS England benchmarking document provided by CREATE IVF:

IVF bench mark pricing pro forma

Description of Currency	Currency Definition What is included	Currency Definition What is excluded at your service?	Queries.
IVF cycle including drugs	2199 All consultations, scans, blood tests,	Freezing and FET not included. Additional £500 charged to	

	medication, procedures (OR and ET), Embryology	include this.	
ICSI cycle including drugs	2199 All consultations, scans, blood tests, medication, procedures (OR and ET), Embryology	Freezing and FET not included. Additional £500 charged to include this.	
Abandoned IVF/ICSI cycle including drugs	500 All consultations, scans, blood tests, medication		
Genetic screening (where required for ICSI)	N/A Not Commissioned in contract		
Frozen cycle with drugs	500 All consultations, scans, blood tests, medication, procedures (FET), Embryology		
Frozen cycle natural	500 All consultations, scans, blood tests, medication, procedures (FET), Embryology		
Donor eggs IVF cycle	Not comparable		
Donor eggs ICSI cycle	Not comparable		
Semen Analysis	25		
Consultation	Included within IVF/ICSI/FET tariff		? included within the outpatient tariff
Follow up appointment	Included withing		When does this take

	IVF/ICSI/FET tariff		place?
Surgical sperm removal			
Donor sperm	350		
IVF for HIV +ve couples.	N/A		
Surrogacy for couples with congenital causes of infertility.	N/A		